

MINUTES

North Carolina Criminal Justice

Education and Training Standards Commission

Planning & Standards Committee

November 16, 2016

The Planning & Standards (P&S) Committee of the North Carolina Criminal Justice Education and Training Standards Commission met at Wake Tech Public Safety Center, Raleigh on Nov. 16th, 2016 at 10:30am.

Committee Members Present

Commissioner Scott Cunningham, Chair
Commissioner Jeff Welty
Commissioner Brent Herron
Commissioner Teresa Jardon
Commissioner James Fisher-Davis
Commissioner James Moore
Commissioner Richard Epley
Commissioner Trey Robison
Commissioner Bill Grey

Guests Present

Monica Shabo, OSDT
Robby Millard, OSDT
Charles Walston, OSDT
Felicia Banks, OSDT
Melanie Wood, DPS Prisons
Tammatha Clodfelter, App State Univ.
Stedman Smith, App State Univ.
Stephanie Crapo, NCSHP
Tony Losada, NCJA
Tracy McPherson, NC Community Colleges

CJ Standards Staff Present

Steven Combs
Trevor Allen
Richard Squires
Charminique Branson
Dawn Suffel
Sharon Witherspoon
Tammie Dame

Call to Order

Chair Scott Cunningham called the committee meeting to order and declared a quorum.

Approval of the August 10th, 2016 Meeting Minutes

Motion to approve was made by Commissioner Trey Robison and **seconded** by Commissioner Jeff Welty. **Motion carried.**

Election of Vice-Chair

Motion to re-elect Commissioner Jeff Welty as committee vice-chair was made by Commissioner Trey Robison and **seconded** by Commissioner James Fisher-Davis. **Motion carried.**

Rule-Making Hearing

Under separate cover.

Proposed Rule Revision – 12 NCAC 09B .0301 - CERTIFICATION OF INSTRUCTOR

Standards legal counsel, Ms. Whitney Belich, presented a proposed change for the committee to consider the Commission's authority to deny, suspend, or revoke an instructors certification when 1) the person has committed an offense which could result in action against the officer's law enforcement certification, or 2) law enforcement certification has been denied, suspended or revoked under NC CJ Commission, Sheriffs' Commission, Company & Campus Police Program, or similar in state, out of state, or federal certifying agencies. The committee discussed that changes to the rule should also address non-law enforcement certified instructors. Ms. Belich cited that language in the rule requiring the same conduct standards for both types of instructors is reasonable. The committee agreed that a change to the rule is warranted and asked that proposed language be improved and presented at the next meeting. Commissioner Cunningham asked committee members to provide additional suggestions, if any, to staff following today's meeting.

Recruitment & Retention Study Presentation

Ms. Charminique Branson along with guest Dr. Tammatha Clodfelter presented survey findings assessing recruiting and retaining high quality officers. The study was conducted by Appalachian State University (ASU), East Carolina University (ECU) and Criminal Justice Training and Standards Division (CJSD). All final results were presented with the exception of the qualitative analysis for Institutional Corrections, which will be available at the February 2017 Commission meeting.

Dr. Tammatha Clodfelter of ASU provided the following summary collected from NC Community Colleges and Universities:

Barriers to Recruitment (rank order)

- Perceived dangerousness of the job
- Pay
- Negative portrayal in the media

- Negatively viewed by the public
- Too much stress related to job

Agency Factors to Promote for Recruitment

- Opportunities for promotion
- Ability to diversify responsibilities
- Relationship or partnership with state and federal agencies
- Comradery
- Public interaction with agency

Role of Media

- Individuals do not believe they are influenced by media, whether it is traditional or online. However, they do believe that others are swayed.
- When asked in general which sources of information are influential, traditional media is important, particularly with those who will not pursue law enforcement. This contradicts the finding that individuals do not believe they are influenced by the media and warrants further investigation.

Role of Social Media

- Social media is believed to influence others' perceptions of law enforcement, but not the respondent's perceptions.
- Recruitment efforts on social media are not influential.

General

- Students with fewer earned credit hours were more likely to pursue law enforcement as a career.
- Females, particularly white females and those with more credit hours are less likely to perceive law enforcement as a suitable career.
- Those who plan to pursue law enforcement as a career indicated that they intend to enter BLET most likely between the spring of 2017 and fall of 2017.

Ms. Charminique Branson (CJSD) presented the following review on behalf of Dr. Heidi Bonner from East Carolina University's (ECU) study of Division of Adult Corrections and Juvenile Justice: Community Corrections, Juvenile Justice and Institutional Corrections:

Community Corrections

Turnover Intent

- 65% of respondents stated that they had thought about quitting their job in the last six months
- 41% stated they currently desired to quit their job
- Non-supervisors had a significantly higher degree of turnover intent compared to supervisors

Exit Information

- Five years of data, from 2011 through 2015, were analyzed
- 54% of employees who left resigned (43% of those did so for better employment)

- The remaining exits were due to retirement, transfer or reassignment, dismissal, or departure while under investigation
- In terms of personal characteristics, respondents who were a minority, who had a graduate degree, and who were younger were more likely to consider leaving
- In terms of work environment perceptions, respondents who perceived that they had less input into decision making, perceived less support from their supervisor, and perceived less ambiguity (role strain) in their job were more likely to indicate an intent to turnover
- In terms of job attitudes, respondents who felt more burned out and who felt less satisfaction with their job were more likely to consider leaving
- Only 14% of respondents felt that community corrections leadership tried to retain personnel
 - a. Respondents provided several suggestions to improve retention related to pay, supervisory support, opportunities for advancement, and other benefits
- When asked what they liked most about their job, a very common response from respondents was the ability to help people, in particular the opportunity to help offenders change their lives for the better
 - a. Respondents also noted every day being different, the opportunity to have a flexible schedule, and the opportunity to do field work as positives aspects of their job
- Respondents noted a number of concerns with community corrections employment including overwork, growing caseloads, low salary, uncertainty stemming from high turnover, the unpredictable schedule of trainings, and constant change regarding what is expected, and how the job is performed
 - a. Additional areas of concern included paperwork, aspects of management, and stress related to being held accountable for the actions of offenders

Juvenile Justice

- Turnover Intent
 - a. 62% of respondents stated that they had thought about quitting their job in the last six months
 - b. 30% stated they currently desired to quit their job
 - c. Juvenile Justice Officers were significantly more likely than Juvenile Court Counselors to indicate an intent to leave
- Exit Information
 - a. Five years of data, from 2011 through 2015, were analyzed
 - b. 44% of employees who left resigned (25% of those did so for better employment)
 - c. The remaining exits were due to retirement, dismissal, the employee not reporting or not certifying, the employee not accepting a transfer, or other reasons
- Predicting turnover intent

- a. The final model included personal characteristics, work environment perceptions, and job attitudes as independent variables
 - b. In terms of personal characteristics, respondents who had served in the military were more likely to consider leaving
 - c. In terms of work environment perceptions, respondents who perceived less ambiguity (role strain) in their job were more likely to indicate intent to turnover.
 - d. In terms of job attitudes, respondents who felt less satisfaction with their job and perceived more work stress were more likely to consider leaving
- Only 29% of respondents felt that community corrections leadership tried to retain personnel.
 - a. Respondents provided several suggestions to improve retention related to pay, incentives and awards for performance, opportunities for advancement, and supervisory support
 - When asked what they liked most about their job, a very common response from respondents was the ability to help people
 - a. Respondents also noted a good work environment and the opportunity to have a flexible schedule as a positive
 - Respondents noted a number of concerns with juvenile justice employment including overwork, administrative duties that reduce the time available for direct services, and limited resources and services for clients
 - a. Additional areas of concern included low salary, lack of support from management, low morale, and the perception that the employee was not valued

Institutional Corrections

- Turnover Intent
 - 56% of respondents stated that they had thought about quitting their job in the last six months
 - 39% stated they currently desired to quit their job
 - Non-supervisors had a significantly higher degree of turnover intent compared to supervisors
- Predicting turnover intent
 - The final model included personal characteristics, work environment perceptions, and job attitudes as independent variables
 - In terms of personal characteristics, respondents who were younger and who had more than a high school education were more likely to consider leaving
 - In terms of work environment perceptions, respondents who perceived that they had less input into decision making, and who perceived less support from their supervisor were more likely to indicate an intent to turnover

- In terms of job attitudes, respondents who felt more work stress and who felt less satisfaction with their job were more likely to consider leaving

Ms. Charminique Branson also presented the following summary on behalf of CJ Training & Standards Division's study of sworn NC Law Enforcement Officers from twenty-six (26) police departments:

- Over half of the respondents became police officers because they had a desire to serve.
- Surveyed officers ranked increased pay and benefits as the top two ways to retain officers.
 - a. Increased pay was the number one response, which implies the desire to serve has diminished over time. Over 62% of the officers said they would leave their agency for a different job industry.
- Over 72% of the officers were married, it can be concluded family dynamics impact the need for benefits.
- Over half of the officers said the overall job satisfaction within their police department was low:
 - a. Poor leadership/ management
 - b. Rotating shifts
 - c. Low pay
- Officers who experienced high morale within their police department identified:
 - a. Great leadership
 - b. Camaraderie
- Over 92% of the officers believe that have a good relationship with their communities.
- Fifty-nine percent believe there is a need for increased opportunity for more police citizen interaction.
- Forty-three percent believe workshops with the media are important to improve community relations.

Medical Guidelines Presentation

Dr. Stephanie Crapo of the NC State Highway Patrol presented a detailed list of recommended changes to the **"Medical Screening Guidelines for Criminal Justice Officers Manual"**. Dr. Crapo explained that changes being presented come from a review conducted by three medical professionals based on what they see in their current practices as well as a comparison of similar guidelines from a number of other states' agencies. Commissioner Cunningham affirmed that staff and legal counsel will conduct a thorough review of today's suggested changes and return with a proposal at the February meeting.

Motion to Adjourn

Motion to adjourn was made by Commissioner Jeff Welty and **seconded** by Commissioner James Fisher-Davis. **Motion carried.**

**RULEMAKING HEARING
RULES REVISIONS**

**North Carolina Criminal Justice
Education and Training Standards Commission
November 16, 2016**

Call to Order

The Planning & Standards (P&S) Committee of the North Carolina Criminal Justice Education and Training Standards Commission met at the Wake Technical Community College, Public Safety Center on Nov. 16th, 2016. This committee presided over the public Rulemaking Hearing with Committee Chair Scott Cunningham calling the hearing to order at 10:30 am. Commissioner Cunningham stated the purpose of the hearing is to receive remarks from any persons interested in commenting on the proposed amendments to the Commission's Administrative Rules.

Committee Members Present

Commissioner Scott Cunningham, Chair
Commissioner Jeff Welty
Commissioner Brent Herron
Commissioner Teresa Jardon
Commissioner James Fisher-Davis
Commissioner James Moore
Commissioner Richard Epley
Commissioner Trey Robison
Commissioner Bill Grey

Guests Present

Monica Shabo, OSDT
Robby Millard, OSDT
Charles Walston, OSDT
Felicia Banks, OSDT
Melanie Wood, DPS Prisons
Tammatha Clodfelter, App State Univ.
Stedman Smith, App State Univ.
Stephanie Crapo, NCSHP
Tony Losada, NCJA
Tracy McPherson, NC Community Colleges

CJ Standards Staff Present

Steven Combs
Trevor Allen
Richard Squires
Charminique Branson
Dawn Suffel
Sharon Witherspoon
Tammie Dame

Commissioner Cunningham advised that proposed amendments would be read and, if needed, the amendments would be explained by staff and stated that after the rules are presented and explained, anyone wishing to comment would be allowed to do so. Commissioner Cunningham noted for the record that there were no written comments or objections received by the rulemaking coordinator. Mr. Cunningham read into the record the proposed rule amendments ---

12 NCAC 09A .0103 - DEFINITIONS

Language in this rule, Item (15), changed "law enforcement agency" to "Criminal Justice Agency" to encompass all agencies under the Commission's oversight.

Motion to adopt change to **09A .0103** and to forward to the full Commission for approval was made by Commissioner Jeff Welty and **seconded** by Commissioner James Fisher-Davis. **Motion carried.**

12 NCAC 09B .0302 – GENERAL INSTRUCTOR CERTIFICATION

Changes to language Item (1)(B) added "or, as an employee of a Criminal Justice Agency" thereby acknowledging all agencies under the Commission's oversight.

12 NCAC 09B .0303 – TERMS AND CONDITIONS OF GENERAL INSTRUCTOR CERTIFICATION

12 NCAC 09B .0305 – TERMS AND CONDITIONS OF SPECIALIZED INSTRUCTOR CERTIFICATION

12 NCAC 09B .0312 – INSTRUCTOR CERTIFICATION RENEWAL

12 NCAC 09G .0102 – DEFINITIONS

12 NCAC 09G .0308 – GENERAL INSTRUCTOR CERTIFICATION

12 NCAC 09G .0309 – TERMS AND CONDITIONS OF GENERAL INSTRUCTOR CERTIFICATION

12 NCAC 09G .0311 – TERMS AND CONDITIONS OF SPECIALIZED INSTRUCTOR CERTIFICATION

12 NCAC 09G .0312 – INSTRUCTOR CERTIFICATION RENEWAL

Amendment to the above rules explains new process for obtaining certification and recertification as a General and/or Specialized Instructor with changes to be effective January 1, 2017. Those changes include:

- Probationary instructors must teach 8 hours [instead of 12] of evaluated commission training within the 12 month probationary period;
- General instructors [certifications] will no longer expire, and hours of instruction will no longer be required as long as the individual completes annual online instructor training update provided through the NC Justice Academy.
- Specialized instructors will continue to be required to teach 12 hours in each specialized topic area within their 3 year certification period as well as complete annual online instructor training update through the Academy.
- Should an instructor fail to complete annual update training, he/she will have 60 days to complete both the update training as well as deliver 8 hours of instruction in order to maintain their certification[s].

Motion to adopt changes to **12 NCAC 09B .0302, 09B .0303, 09B .0305, 09B .0312, 09G .0102, 09G .0308, 09G .0309, 09G .0311, and 09G .0312** and to forward to the full Commission for approval was made by Commissioner Jeff Welty and **seconded** by Commissioner Richard Epley. **Motion carried.**

Commissioner Tracy McPherson representing NC Community Colleges inquired about group notification concerning instructor changes. Deputy Director Trevor Allen replied that notification began in August during the 2016 School Directors Conference with staff's plans to further notify all involved entities by written correspondence following the November Commission's approval of the changes.

12 NCAC 09B .0403 – EVALUATION FOR TRAINING WAIVER

Revision to this rule clarifies lateral requirements of officers certified under the NC Sheriffs' Commission who wish to transfer under the Criminal Justice Commission detailing that the Standards Division shall evaluate applicant based on a combination of criteria to coincide with what is required of transferring law enforcement officers. Sheriffs' transfers must complete annual in-service training while in an active status making it consistent with officers under the CJ Commission. Revision also addresses conditions for applicants awarded certification via the BLET Challenge and for anyone elected Sheriff.

Motion to adopt change to **09B .0403** and to forward to the full Commission for approval was made by Commissioner Teresa Jardon and **seconded** by Commissioner Richard Epley. **Motion carried.**

The committee discussed the need for a group notification within Sheriffs' Standards. Director Steven Combs stated that CJ Standards will work closely with the Director of Sheriffs' Standards to ensure information gets successfully distributed.

Commissioner Cunningham called an end of the rulemaking hearing.